Measuring Results for Effective Policymaking

Stefanie Brodmann, World Bank
Yann Pouget, World Bank
Assessment & Evaluation

- **Retrospective**
  - Look back and judge
  - Project either delivers or doesn’t (drop?)

- **Prospective**
  - Decide what need to learn
  - Experiment with alternatives
  - Measure and inform
  - Adopt best alternative
Big Questions - small questions
Migration as Development

- “Reducing unemployment”
- “Enhance employment opportunities for youth”
- “Protection”
- “Skill recognition”
- “Would like my government’s intervention to achieve transfer of skills and technology for development and poverty reduction”
Promote Safe and Legal Migration
small questions

- How to facilitate labor market insertion upon arrival?
- How to reduce vulnerability?
What is a results chain?

- Developmental hypothesis that helps you define:
  - what you are doing and for what purpose
  - what needs to be monitored and
  - what needs to be evaluated
Objectives

Specific goals of the program or policy to be implemented

- Facilitate labor market insertion of migrant workers upon arrival in host countries
- Decrease vulnerability of migrant workers
The Results Chain for Pre-departure Orientation

Objectives

- Facilitate labor market insertion of migrant workers upon arrival in host countries
- Decrease vulnerability of migrant workers

Inputs

- Teachers
- Former migrants
- Training centers/class rooms
- Videos
- Text books
- Computers
- Financial, human, and other resources mobilized to support activities

Activities

- Expectation management
- Cultural orientation & language training
- Administrative information
- Financial education
- Targeted vocational training
- Actions taken or work performed to convert inputs into specific outputs

Implementation
The Results Chain for Pre-departure Orientation

**Objectives**

- Facilitate labor market insertion of migrant workers upon arrival in host countries
- Decrease vulnerability of migrant workers

**Inputs**

- Teachers
- Former migrants
- Training centers/classrooms
- Videos
- Text books
- Computers

**Activities**

- Expectation management
- Cultural orientation & language training
- Administrative information
- Financial education
- Targeted vocational training

**Outputs**

Project deliverables within the control of implementing agency

**Monitor and Process Evaluation**

- Take up rate
- Training modules completed
- Distribution of handbooks to departing migrants
Monitoring and Process Evaluation

- Assessment of the use of resources and the implementation process as the project happens
- Both qualitative and quantitative indicators of outputs
- Direct participation of key stakeholders involved (project beneficiaries, family members, officials running programs, etc.) e.g., through interviews and questionnaires
- Continuous throughout implementation
The Results Chain for Pre-departure Orientation

**Objectives**
- Facilitate labor market insertion of migrant workers upon arrival in host countries
- Decrease vulnerability of migrant workers

**Inputs**
- Teachers
- Former migrants
- Training centers/classrooms
- Videos
- Text books
- Computers

**Activities**
- Expectation management
- Cultural orientation & language training
- Administrative information
- Financial education
- Targeted vocational training

**Outputs**
- Take up rate
- Training modules completed
- Distribution of handbooks to departing migrants

**Outcomes**
- Use of outputs by beneficiaries & stakeholders outside the control of implementing agency
  - Faster labor market insertion in receiving country
  - Decreased vulnerability at the workplace
  - Faster social integration of migrants upon arrival

**Results**
The Results Chain for Pre-departure Orientation

**Objectives**
- Facilitate labor market insertion of migrant workers upon arrival in host countries
- Decrease vulnerability of migrant workers

**Activities**
- Teachers
- Former migrants
- Training centers/class rooms
- Videos
- Text books
- Computers
- Expectation management
- Cultural orientation & language training
- Administrative information
- Financial education
- Targeted vocational training
- Take up rate
- Training modules completed
- Distribution of handbooks to departing migrants

**Outputs**
- Faster labor market insertion in receiving country
- Decreased vulnerability at the workplace
- Distribution of handbooks to departing migrants
- Financial education
- Targeted vocational training
- Expectation management
- Cultural orientation & language training
- Administrative information
- Financial education
- Take up rate
- Training modules completed
- Distribution of handbooks to departing migrants

**Outcomes**
- Faster labor market insertion in receiving country
- Decreased vulnerability at the workplace
- Distribution of handbooks to departing migrants

**Long-term Results**
Changes in outcomes that have multiple drivers
- Lower unemployment gap between migrants and native workers in receiving countries
- Higher remittance flows
- Higher acceptance of migrants in receiving countries and international support

**Evaluate whether program is effective / results are achieved**
Impact Evaluation

- Periodic assessment of causal effect of policy or program
- “What would have happened if the program had not existed”? 
- Estimate the state of those affected by the program (treatment group) would have been in the absence of the program (compare against a control group)
- Evaluate short-term or long-term outcomes (impacts) of the intervention
Impact evaluation contributes if:

- **Policy relevant**: address the important issues policy makers face
- **Operationally driven**: reflect the learning priorities of programs and policies
- **Institutionalized**: there is a process to produce and feed results back into the policy process
“Reducing unemployment”
“Enhance employment opportunities for youth”
“Protection”
“Skill recognition”
“Would like my government’s intervention to achieve transfer of skills and technology for development and poverty reduction”
The Results Chain: Employment & Protection

- Facilitate migration into jobs abroad
- Protect migrants
NEXT: Do we know ex ante...
What is the best moment to train and the ideal duration of training given the resources?
Which mix of non-technical training, language training, and technical training can best improve the labor market insertion of migrant workers upon arrival?
How pre-departure training programs can enhance workers’ rights protection?
Which training material and language of communication will better reach migrant workers?
Which types of trainers will better deliver the training? Should former migrants be involved?
Would private providers and NGOs deliver better training?
 Trial and error

- We turn to our best judgment for guidance and pick a package of training services, instructors, training material, course venue and duration ...
- Get inspiration from ‘best practice’
- Is there any other package, training material, staging that will do better?
Pick up the ball: What is a results tree?

- A results tree is a representation of the set of results chains that are considered viable during policy/program design or restructuring.

- It is a set of (competing) policy and operational alternatives to reach a specific objective.
Decision tree... migration training

- Migration orientation
  - Pre-decision making
    - Information
    - Training
  - Pre-departure training
    - Information
    - Technical training
      - Soft skills
      - Cultural sensitivity
      - Basic language
  - Pre-embarkation:
    - Information
    - Training
How to select between plausible alternatives?

- Test critical nodes of the decisions tree
- Start with what you need to know most
- Move along the decision tree as more results comes in and options are sorted out
- Cannot learn everything at once
- Select carefully what you want to test by involving all relevant partners
Fear of failure?

- When we compare and adopt better alternatives, we cannot fail, we can only get closer to success
- Reward systems need to recognize trial and error as part of the learning process
  - Managerial incentives a good place to start
Decision tree... Intermediation & Protection

- Intermediation & Protection
  - Public
    - Heavy Regulation
    - Joint and solitary contract
    - Minimum wage
  - Private
    - Light Regulation
    - Code of conduct
    - Validate contracts
    - Pre-departure training
  - Public-Private Partnership
    - Information