Global Forum on MIGRATION & DEVELOPMENT
GFMD | Mauritius 2012

Background Paper

(Original version: English)

Roundtable 1: Circulating Labour for Inclusive Development -

RT Session 1.1: *Beyond-the-Border Skills and Jobs for Human Development*

Co-Chairs of RT 1.1: Mauritius and United Arab Emirates (UAE)

Team members preparing the Session: Bangladesh, Costa Rica, France, Germany, Philippines, Sweden, Switzerland, ILO, IOM

Roundtable 1 Coordinators: Dr Irena Omelaniuk; Dr Salomon Samen

Executive Summary

This background paper supports the preparations and discussions of GFMD 2012 Roundtable Session 1.1. It offers current research findings and evidence on policies and practices that support the key assumption of this Roundtable that the opportunity to work abroad can accelerate human development if the right conditions and policies are in place to enable mobile workers to acquire new skills, use their skills productively, have their skills recognized in the origin and destination countries and return with enhanced potential for successful socio-economic re-integration. Skills and jobs are central planks in any development strategy, regardless of whether the country is receiving or sending mobile workers: education and income are key indicators in the UNDP's Human Development Index.

The paper discusses how governments, the private sector and other stakeholders can improve the knowledge, skills and employment prospects of persons seeking to work abroad, including when they return home, in the context of circulating or globally mobile labour.[1] It builds on earlier GFMD work on raising the gains of migration for development, particularly through cooperative schemes between countries of origin and destination to facilitate mobility and circulation of labour and skills to mutual developmental benefit.[2] Examples of such cooperative schemes are briefly described in Annex 2.

1. Background and Context

1.1 Objectives and rationale

This paper pursues the key objectives of RT 1.1:

1. To identify effective models (or strategies to create them) of vocational training, skills enhancement and skills recognition, to optimise developmental benefits across the migration cycle;
2. To contribute to the wider Roundtable 1 debate about how to enhance human development potential in countries of origin, transit and destination through skills and job-matching strategies and provide support to diaspora as potential agents of development, and the larger debates on the legal migration frameworks that help achieve these goals;
3. In the longer term, to improve the knowledge, skills and employment prospects of returning migrants, particularly in the context of temporary and circulatory forms of overseas contract work.

To date, the GFMD has effectively addressed various aspects of international labour mobility and its gains for development, in particular through economic and social protection and empowerment of overseas contract workers. But there remain gaps to fill and new perspectives to consider in designing and implementing more comprehensive policies for developing, improving, certifying and recognizing employable skills that can secure these gains for the migrant and for their countries of origin and destination.

1.2. Skilling migrants: the policy context

With the ever increasing global mobility of workers, many governments are recognizing that it is in their mutual interest to jointly create the conditions for human capital formation, skills mobility, and productive investments by migrant workers, in order to leverage labour mobility for better

---

[1] While labour mobility occurs in temporary, permanent, regulated and unregulated contexts, this Roundtable session will limit itself to a discussion of skills development, certification and recognition for enhanced job matching abroad and at home in the context of regular temporary and circular labour mobility.

[2] The paper is structured to present evidence-based practice and examples wherever possible. Where more detail is required to aid understanding, this is provided in the form of endnotes in Annex 2. Terms used in the paper are presented in Annex 1.

development outcomes.[i][3] Migration policy frameworks should not only assure legality of status, but include enablers, whereby migrants gain skills and experience that enable them to progress through socio-economic mobility, in both the sending and receiving country.[4]

There is increasing recognition by many countries of destination that migration can meet some of the evolving labour demands, and bring innovation, to societies undergoing major demographic changes: in Sweden, the utilisation of diaspora' and migrants' experience, knowledge and business networks is seen as a way to channel ideas into innovation and development.[ii] A flexible and enabling legal framework can make it possible for migrants to move back and forth between countries of origin and destination, and contribute to economic and human development in both[iii].

Temporary migration, with time limits on residence, is often used to fill skills shortages, but it may not always contribute to human development. Some migrants experience employment conditions in which their skills stagnate or even regress (de-skilling) due to ineffective placement or job matching (e.g. a university graduate employed as domestic help); and there can be brain waste in the economy. The low skilled and transient nature of most temporary circular migration schemes can also inhibit the acquisition of skills that would enhance a worker's reintegration into the job market upon return, unless reintegration measures are invested in as part of the migration scheme. Country of origin governments often do not link occupational training schemes abroad, or labour emigration programs, to the sectoral needs or development programs back home.

Skills under-matching and de-skilling have been identified as obstacles to optimizing the benefits of labour migration for development. However, skills under-matching does not automatically equate with de-skilling. New skills may be acquired which are in demand in the origin country or can be used to support reintegration, such as project management, financial or small business management skills, and language skills. Also, if individual human development outcomes are only measured in terms of accumulated income, then de-skilling may only be a problem when workers return home and are not able to earn more than before they left. These challenges may be best understood and addressed in the context of the full migration cycle, in both countries of origin and destination.

While the underutilization of immigrant skills in destination countries (e.g. in the EU) is a growing concern to origin countries, few are acting to ensure the proper utilization of enhanced or new skills of workers when they return home. Systems are needed in origin and destination countries to encourage mutually beneficial skills development, certification, recognition and job-matching. They can be unilateral, bilateral or factored into multilateral frameworks, such as between the EU and Africa).

Skills recognition processes should be readily understood and simple to apply, so migrants can seek recognition of their qualifications and experience and enjoy the full benefits of their work abroad.[iv] The impact of such policies and practices, as demonstrated in, for example, Australia and among EU nations, is to facilitate better matching of jobs to the skills of migrants.

Evidence[v] suggests that approaches driven by the private sector are likely to bring the best job-skills matches, yet employers are often insufficiently involved with skills development, enhancement and recognition in most countries of destination and origin.[vi][5] Governments should set the appropriate standards, based on international benchmarks, and the enabling legal migration frameworks. Involving employers and professional associations in skills recognition can ensure that assessment procedures are tailored to real labour market needs.[vii] Some of the best examples exist in developed countries of destination (Australia, Canada, Germany, Switzerland), and while they specifically serve those labour market interests, they may also offer models for leveraging or replication elsewhere,

---

[3] Holzmann, R. and Pouget-Hirschegg V. (2011). *Admission Schemes for Foreign Workers: A Labour Market Tool for National Economic Development*, p. 8.
[4] Vertovec S, (2007) *Circular Migration: the way forward in global policy?* Institute of Migration, University of Oxford (First appeared in 'Around the Globe', a publication of the Monash Institute for Study of Global Movements, Australia).
[5] *Skills Recognition for Returning Migrant Workers*: Note from ILO/SKILLS-AP/KOREA Regional Training Workshop on Skills Assessment of Returning Migrant Workers 15–16 September 2010, Bangkok

including in countries of origin. A number of interesting approaches are now being developed in the Gulf Cooperation Countries (GCC), where economic activity is heavily reliant on migrant labour.[viii]

Bilateral agreements can provide effective frameworks for skills development and job matching. Countries like Germany are presently experimenting with such agreements with some Southeast European countries, especially in the context of care professions. Some bilateral agreements have been discussed in earlier GFMD meetings (e.g. Mauritius-Canada/France; Senegal-France; Colombia-Spain).[6] However, most countries have only limited ability to influence the migration policies of high income, destination countries. For example, although the Philippines has defined minimum wage levels for a number of key occupations of its overseas Filipino workers, without a bilateral agreement destination countries may prefer to let the market decide the wage levels.

2. The acquisition and development of migrant skills and job matching: good practices

2.1 *The role and value of skills development, certification and recognition*

The typical nature of low skilled employment abroad is unlikely to provide skills that support reintegration when workers return home at the end of their contract, unless there is interest and effort to train in the destination country. Skills on return after a period of migration may, therefore, no longer reflect the original expertise of the migrants. In many cases, skills acquisition may be incidental, for example in languages. But even where any new skills acquired abroad may be at a low level, they could still be relevant for employment or business in the home country, if the mechanisms exist to recognize and accept such skills.[7]

In countries such as India, acquisition of basic skills is a means to improve the lives of individuals, their families and communities.[8] Some participants may see skills acquisition as a step to migration: a means to demonstrate essential, assessed skills at an entry level before they leave their homes. If other standard requirements of migration, such as medical checks, were conducted *in situ*, i.e. were more immediately accessible, migrants would be both better prepared and employment-ready once they meet recruitment agents or prospective employers.

Initiatives such as this should be underpinned by *mutual recognition agreements*, and through national or regional (meta) qualifications frameworks where one country aligns the learning outcomes of training programs to comparable programs in other countries. This allows migrants once they arrive in a destination country to continue developing their skills and transfer the skills acquired at destination back to their home country at the end of the contract.

Increasingly, *national qualifications frameworks (NQFs)*[9] and mutual recognition schemes are being used as enabling mechanisms to compare and reference qualifications delivered in different countries. Where these frameworks are linked or referenced across borders, also regionally - for example, within the European Qualifications Framework (EQF), the ASEAN Framework or the new Arab Qualifications Framework (for the Gulf and MENA regions) - transnational labour market mobility can occur more readily. Focusing more specifically on skills, National Skills Development

---

[6] Some African countries like Senegal have entered into agreements with France to enable their workers to receive benefits under French social safety net provisions. Algeria, Morocco, Philippines and Tunisia have entered into agreements with their main destination countries to ensure that emigrants are provided social security and to shield them against racism and xenophobia (Black R and Hilker L (2004).

[7] McCormick B and Wahba J *Return International Migration and Geographical Inequality: the case of Egypt.* Journal of African Economics 12(4) 2003

[8] There is at least one organization which is delivering learning in remote rural areas by taking wireless and satellite equipment on trucks and even on the backs of elephants to communities where electricity may be unreliable. Through distance learning and Skype, training programs can be conducted cheaply and efficiently, with online tutors observing individuals as they apply their newly acquired skills in real time.

[9] See ILO research on NQFs:
http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_emp/@ifp_skills/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_126589.pdf

Frameworks are being developed in some countries such as South Africa, to define the knowledge, skills and attitudes required by individuals in the workplace.[ix] NQFs can also be used as a vehicle to protect the domestic labour force of a country that "receives" a lot of migrant workers, since they do not always bring the right sets of skills from their countries of origin.

Early discussions of a *Global Mutual Recognition Scheme,* supported by UNESCO, are an important step in ensuring skills alignment and recognition for migrants and citizens alike. European Union experiences point to the diversity of pathways for assessing, validating and recognizing formal, but also informal and non-formal, learning of non-EU nationals.[10] The EU's automatic recognition framework through the EQF currently applies only to EU citizens moving from one Member State to another[11] and not to third-country nationals, although the European Training Foundation (ETF) is now working on including European 'neighbouring' countries in this. Some interesting lessons have emerged. For example, the fragmentation and complexity of recognition procedures internationally and within countries,[12] due to differing administrative structures and roles of subnational actors, have caused migrants not to seek recognition of their qualifications in the first place. This lies behind current moves to develop global recognition systems that simplify the articulation processes.[13]

Nonetheless, in the EU (particularly UK and the Netherlands), recognition systems exist which allow for skills assessments and the transfer of credits obtained through forms of informal or workplace learning other than just formal learning (i.e. university degree, diploma etc.). A new law on recognition in Germany allows for operational experience acquired abroad to be taken into account where foreign credentials based on formal learning are not sufficient for full recognition, and gives orientation on how to acquire full recognition. Actions to reduce the complexity of the recognition process include the creation of *one-stop shops* for recognition at national level[14] and to improve coordination among the different authorities involved in the recognition process.

Recognition schemes can also apply at a local level. For example, the Saskatchewan Institute for Applied Science and Technology (SIAST) Skills Passport Scheme[x] is offered in Ukraine and the Philippines to reduce costs and risks to employers in the destination country, and supports the Mauritian-Canadian circular migration program. In Germany, some hospitals adapt the training for nurses and carers from Bosnia-Herzegovina to facilitate and accelerate the process of skills development.[xi] The National Recognition Information Centre in the UK provides advice on comparability of international qualifications, facilitating job matches by employers in the UK, and is used as a reference in other countries.[xii] Where definitions are based on common occupational classifications, or on international standards such as ISCO[15], these 'skills passports' provide a common currency to support migrant mobility. Schemes such as the Construction Skills card schemes in the UK[xiii] provide a 'passport' based on essential skills needed for specific construction-related occupations and trades.

---

[10] See the IOM LINET network (IOM LINET, www.labormigration.eu)

[11] Anecdotal evidence suggests that even this (within the EU) does not work automatically and often implies recognition through testing skills.

[12] For example, the UK has four qualification frameworks, which complicates mutual recognition schemes between the devolved nations of the UK and between vocational and higher education across the UK:
http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@ed_emp/@ifp_skills/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_126589.pdf

[13] See also page 4 and endnote xxi

[14] Such as NARIC in the UK

[15] ISCO is a tool for organising jobs into clearly defined groups according to the tasks and duties undertaken in the job. Its main aims are to provide: a basis for the international reporting, comparison and exchange of statistical and administrative data about occupations; a model for the development of national and regional classifications of occupations; and a system that can be used directly in countries that have not developed their own national classifications. Many countries use ISCO as a means to define occupations, facilitating international comparisons and the potential development and application of common occupational standards.

2.2   Skills development and job-matching

One effective way of delivering skills that will be recognized for job placement abroad is to incentivise the overseas employer to invest in training and education of the workforce required in the destination country. To maximize the benefits of certification and recognition programs, the origin and destination countries could work together to ensure that the skills acquired before emigration are properly recognized in the destination country. This will be explored further in section 2.4.

A number of countries of origin have adjusted their national education and training programs to offer internationally recognized curricula and qualifications in a wide range of sectors where there are skills shortages in higher income countries (including hospitality, caregiving, nursing, teaching (India[16], Philippines[17], Jamaica[18], South Africa[19]).[xiv] However, some of these schemes have been problematic, largely because of misplaced expectations on the part of one or both countries. Furthermore, such schemes tend to focus on professional or para-professional roles, rather than the lower skilled mass migration evidenced in a number of countries.

Where there is no formal NQF, or skills development framework, another option is to develop *national occupational standards* to define skills requirements and assess competency against them, to support skills recognition and mobility. Where these standards are based on, or aligned with, internationally recognized parameters, such as the International Labour Organization classifications, they can support transnational mobility. In the UAE, occupational standards are being developed by several federal bodies working together, based on ILO classifications and drawing on best practice elsewhere (primarily Oman and the UK), to provide a baseline for developing systems to assess competency of migrant construction workers and to ensure they are developed and trained to international standards while in their destination country. There is therefore, a specific, emerging link between skills and job-matching, and in the future, skills acquisition in a destination country. Each country, however, needs to develop its own standards and national systems, not just "policy-borrow" from early NQF adopters.

The International Network of Sector Skills Organisations (INSSO) is a relatively new non-governmental body aiming to promote and progress the development of sector-based vocational skills and workforce development and support the development of national and transnational skills standards. Government-funded or government-based bodies from a number of countries have joined INSSO (India, South Africa, Australia, Canada, Netherlands, New Zealand, UK and Pakistan), recognizing the value of aligned sector-based occupational standards in supporting labour mobility. The sector-based approach uniquely bridges the gap between industry partners and educators, ultimately enabling access to better skilled individuals who are, as a result, more employable.

Where the national occupational standards and classifications are not internationally recognized, some labour source countries now require training and certification of the competency of their workers against international standards in order to gain an employment visa. Some of these arrangements have been discussed in earlier GFMD meetings (e.g. Mauritius-Canada/France; Senegal-France; Colombia-Spain).[20] . In other countries, such as the Philippines, the introduction of occupational standards potentially impacts on remittances sent back to the origin country. Filipinos account for around 30 percent of all seafarers globally, who send home around $300 million (Pesos 12.9 billion) a year in remittances. If the Portugal-based European Maritime Safety Agency were to find that Philippine

---

[16] In India, "City and Guilds"[16] has signed an agreement with Manipal Education, one of India's largest education providers, to deliver training through IndiaSkills.

[17] Japan-Philippines and Japan-Indonesia Economic Partnership Agreements.

[18] A scheme training nurses in Jamaica for the Canadian market, which was halted in 2011, since three years after the scheme was launched, the vast majority of those trained were still in Jamaica, having paid large financial costs to be trained.

[19] *The impact of international teacher migration on schooling in developing countries—the case of Southern Africa,* Simon Appleton*, Amanda Sives and W. John Morgan School of Economics, University of Nottingham, UK; School of Politics and Communication Studies, University of Liverpool; School of Education, University of Nottingham, UK

[20] *Ibid*, Black R and Hilker L (2004).

training standards are not within international SCTW standards, the loss of Filipino jobs in this sector would affect the 25 percent of remittances received by the Philippines from seafarers.[21]

In the European Union, many countries are developing, promoting or maintaining multilateral and bilateral agreements for skills recognition linked to job matching. Frameworks can be region-specific or sector-specific, such as in the example of the engineering card.[22][xv] The Ontario Skills Passport provides clear descriptions of the Essential Skills and work habits important for work, learning and life; it is not currently used to support job matching, but with its focus on generic skills could support labour mobility.[xvi] A region-specific example is the Europass system, which facilitates job matching through a *common definition of experience and mobility.*[xvii] On a global scale, there are examples of countries of destination, such as Australia, which apply multiple pathways to occupational/professional registration according to the country of origin.[23]

2.3 Capacity building and cooperation to better match workers and jobs across borders

We have already seen that schemes to develop skills for other nations may not work if standards for mutual recognition between countries are not agreed upon at the outset, or if jobs fail to materialise. An alternative approach is to have the employers, rather than the providers, invest directly in capacity building within a given industry sector. The experience of Japan and Norway in investing in the seamanship skills of Filipinos exemplifies this approach: the Norwegian Training Center, Manila (NTC-M), was established by the Norwegian Ship owners' Association (NSA) to provide relevant upgrading training for Filipino seafarers serving on the ships of its members.[xviii] Another example is the program and infrastructure upgrading by IOM of a vocational training centre in Egypt to meet the labour market needs of Italian and Egyptian employers, which is funded by the Italian government.[xix]

At the policy level, Sweden has identified development as one of the explicit goals of its migration policy. Among other things, Sweden highlights the benefits of spontaneous circular migration as a flexible framework that allows migrants to choose if and when to return. In order to maximise skills- and jobs-matching, the Swedish rules for labour migration are demand-driven and open to migrants of all skill levels and all sectors, i.e. the employer decides whom they want to hire[xx]. The OECD concluded that Sweden's labour migration policy is one of the most open in the OECD, which has helped businesses hire foreign workers quickly and at low transaction costs, without harming conditions for local workers.[24]

The Czech Republic[25] resolution on migration (2010) prioritises circular migration for the purposes of filling labour shortages. It enables the country to respond to rapid changes in the economy and offers low skilled workers temporary work while internal capacity is being built. Slovenia has developed specific schemes to allow temporary migration to be used in sectors experiencing skills shortages. In Malta, the emphasis is on improving skills levels and training nationals, wherever possible, to mitigate the impact of migration.[26] It is too early in each case to say how effective these approaches are.

Legal frameworks could do more to take account of labour market needs in both receiving and sending countries and in particular to stem 'brain drain'. In many African and Asian countries, medical studies may be a ticket to emigrate, but there may often also be a severe shortage of medical workers. Preventing migration is not an option as it impinges on human rights. Finland factors into its

---

[21] Report from *Sun Star Manila*, December 4th 2011.

[22] The European Federation of National Engineering Associations (FEANI) is facilitating the movement of practicing engineers within and outside the geographical area of FEANI's member countries and is establishing a framework of mutual recognition of qualifications to enable engineers wishing to practice abroad to carry with them a guarantee of competence.

[23] For example, the registration procedures for Indian medical doctors are faster than those for other countries, based on recognised quality standards and robust qualification outcomes in Indian medical schools.

[24] OECD (2011), *Recruiting Immigrant Workers: Sweden 2011*, OECD Publishing:
http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264000000-en

[25] See the EMN (European Migration Network) Annual Policy Report Czech Republic 2011: CZ_20120612_AnnualPolicyReport2011_Final.pdf

[26] See the various EMN (European Migration Network) National Reports for Slovenia and Malta.

bilateral development cooperation the potential impact that migration can have on countries of origin. For example, recruitment of third party nationals should not result in brain drain or labour skills shortages in vulnerable sectors, or impact adversely on social or economic development in those countries.

Mauritius and France have been at the leading edge of migration capacity development. In 2008, a labour agreement was signed which allows Mauritians to work in France for a specified period of time, gain experience, save money and return to Mauritius to find employment in new sectors or set up Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) with support from the French authorities for training (partly through a dedicated training centre), equipment and financial assistance for the start-up. The agreement is unique in that it was developed with strong political will from both countries – and it addresses skilled and professional workers (graduated Mauritian students from French universities, those willing to have an internship in France and young professionals) as well as skilled and semi-skilled workers from a list of 61 occupations.

One of the few schemes to be evaluated for its impact is the Netherlands Pilot Circular Migration Programme known as the 'Blue Birds' program,[27] designed for 160 semi-skilled workers from South Africa and Indonesia employed on a trilateral basis, which ended prematurely in 2011. The evaluation suggested that if labour migration programs are not driven by supply and demand, facilitating the needs of employers and employees via existing structures, they are likely to fail.[xxi] This is supported by the first review of a smaller, on-going 'Triple Win Pilot' implemented by the German Agency for International Cooperation (GIZ) and the German Federal Employment Agency. It suggests that there is no 'one size fits all' solution (especially as return is not always the best outcome), and that labour migration schemes have to take into account the specific situation of individuals in occupations in both countries to build up sustainable models. Governments, organizations and individuals must be equal partners to secure success and be willing to support and respect the goals of each as the basis for shared innovation and shared benefits.

2.4   What happens next? Supporting reverse migration or repatriation

Emerging economies like those of India or China, with large expatriate communities abroad, are increasingly seeking to attract their qualified people back home. India has also started to address the issue of 're-patriates ('re-pats')', people who have benefited from working outside the country and are now actively seeking to make positive changes back home. Technology, rising standards of governance and the English language are helping India to be more global.[28] A number of forward-looking entrepreneurs are beginning to set up social businesses to help support reintegration, especially of those Indians who were born or have lived elsewhere, to help with their social adjustment and support them with, for example, micro-financing. Some of these organizations are being set up by 're-pats'. However, repatriation processes may not be supported by global recognition schemes at home, despite a national vocational qualifications framework and the development of occupational standards in key sectors In India.

Despite a large population, China is short of talent particularly in the professional services, advertising and luxury sectors. The country's emphasis on building research and academic capacity means there is much hiring going on in these sectors, including of 'sea turtles' (Chinese expatriates who studied in the west or are naturalised in a western country). This new trend in migration is likely to impact on the supply and demand of, for example, foreign professionals employed in pharmaceuticals and biotechnology, technology, construction, banking, finance and automotive industries. But as with India, there is limited skills recognition back home.[29]

---

[27] *Towards Sensible Labour Migration Policies: Lessons Learned and Recommendations,* Ministry of Foreign Affairs and HIT Foundation, November 2011.

[28] *The rigours of India's 'repatriates'* Gulf News, 5th May 2012, Repatriates are nationals who have been living abroad for more or less long periods of time; they may also be the children of nationals who were born abroad.

[29] *Expats on the road East*, article in The National, UAE 17 May 2012.

Smaller countries like Mongolia are also systematically trying to attract their diaspora back home. This arises from a fast growing need for highly skilled labour to utilize their huge potential of primary commodities such as coal, copper or gold. The German Government, through its Centre for International Migration and Development (CIM), is advising the Mongolian Government on how to develop a return and reintegration program (the so-called "beehive programme") for its diaspora.

In Thailand[30], repatriation of labour migrants is the sole responsibility of the Thai authorities, especially embassies in destination countries. At present, however, there is no official scheme to reintegrate labour migrants on return to Thailand. It remains to be explored whether they need specific skills-focused support to find stable long-term livelihoods, or if they only want assistance to fund the brokerage fees from recruiting agencies in order to finance subsequent re-migration.

International organizations like IOM and UNDP have run a number of programs supported by governments in destination countries that enable expatriates to return to their countries of origin, mostly or initially on a short-term basis, to develop human resource capacity. Examples include UNDP's longstanding TOKTEN program or IOM's program for Ghanaian health professionals in Europe (MIDA Ghana Health III) [xxii], which trains local health workers in Ghana. IOM also runs Return and Reintegration schemes for returning labour migrants, which offer business start-up training and in some instances start-up funds to those wishing to become self-employed.

Many countries are still exploring ways to maximise the benefits of circular migration for returning workers or those moving within destination countries to other employment. However, this normally involves matching labour supply in one participating country with demand in another[31]. In 2007, the EU endorsed circular migration as a tool to help address EU labour market needs, maximise benefits in countries of origin by facilitating skills transfer, and mitigate the risks of brain drain among highly skilled and labour market shortages among lower skilled workers. A new scheme in the UAE is encouraging migrants who develop skills while working to move to new jobs.[32] These approaches enable migrants to continue their wealth creation and skills development in a reasonably secure environment, while the country benefits from skilled workers trained to pre-defined standards.

In Spain, the farmer's union, through its philanthropic foundation, offers newly-arrived seasonal workers from Colombia information about healthcare, other services, labour laws and remittance transfers. It also assists those who wish to establish SMEs in Colombia on their return with technical assistance and funding.[33]

Good examples of labour migration collaboration are not confined to north-south movement. Labour migration from Nicaragua to Costa Rica[34] is a good example of two countries working collaboratively within a south-south scheme. It combines legal regulation and social responsibility in the construction, agriculture and agro-industries.[xxiii] In this example, skills acquisition is secondary to creating a social framework for migrants to be secure and supported in the destination and origin country, but social responsibility could be interpreted as including skills development for the individual in order to build human capital.

---

[30] '*From Asia to Europe and Back: A rapid assessment of Thai workers travelling to and from the European Union, and available assistance'*. Foundation for Women (undated) EU/ILO publication

[31] Fargues P, *Circular migration: is it relevant for the South and East of the Mediterranean?* CARIM Analytic and Synthetic Notes 2008/40; Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, European University Institute, 2008. See also the background papers for RT 1.4, GFMD 2007, Brussels (http://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/MPI-GlobalForum_circularmigration.pdf).

[32] In the UAE, a new policy of the Ministry of Labour on internal labour mobility is designed to enable migrant workers coming to the end of their contract to be able to send a text about their skills and experience to a central database of experienced available labour in the country.

[33] By 2006, 1200 Colombians had participated in the program; which facilitated social as well as economic integration for returning migrants.

[34] Communication from Costa Rica delegation to GFMD, (May 2012)

2.5   Elements of a coherent policy framework

Previous Roundtables have emphasised the importance of developing coherent policy frameworks that take account of the whole migration cycle from pre-departure information through to schemes to support job-skills matching in the destination country and reintegration in home countries, within a secure legal context for the migrants. The evidence in this paper reasserts that need, but emphasises the importance of skills development and recognition for enabling migrants to be more economically included and improve their human and social development through the migration process.

The key contextual elements to achieve these are as follows:

1. *Enabling environments in the country of destination:* legal frameworks that support acquisition of citizenship[35] and other enabling social environments may attract migrants at all skills levels to participate in repeated circular migration. Governments may need to consider whether circular and temporary migration should be encouraged in sectors where there is already significant supply.[36]   Where there is long term unemployment, local employment should perhaps be the priority for a nation with skills shortages. However, where there are skills gaps – for example, if a nation needs doctors or teachers and the unemployed have low skills - migration may provide a medium term solution until capacity can be built.

2. *Coherent national policy frameworks.* Evidence suggests that there is value in factoring skills development and recognition into regular labour mobility programs. Entry visas should be contingent upon a binding job contract, salary, possibility of changing employers within the visa duration, and the obligation of employers to provide accommodation and access to grievance mechanisms, and even skills training. In Europe, the 2010 proposal for a Directive on Common EU Procedure for Entry and Residence of Seasonal Workers from Third-Countries, is currently pending approval, and would address these issues. However, this will not give migrant workers employment rights on a permanent basis.

   Investment in multinational regional economic integration. Liberalisation of labour mobility (for example, across West Africa, Abu Dhabi Dialogue) and mobility partnerships can lead to specific unilateral, bilateral and regional skills development partnerships and programs that involve the public and/or private sector in both destination and origin countries. The Abu Dhabi[xxiv] dialogue is a good example of the role of transnational and regional mobility partnerships: an incubator for a regional cluster of cooperation among origin and destination countries. This type of approach could be at the heart of future labour supply, skills enhancement and recognition. Some observers consider that labour supply should be covered by General Agreements on Trade in Services (GATS). Mode 4 (Service delivered within the territory of the Member) would provide binding specific commitments which may then be developed at a later stage (still in progress).[37] [xxv]

2.6   Skills development and recognition solutions for further discussion

Set against the preceding legal context, a number of solutions supporting bilateral or multilateral skills recognition and job matching schemes are identified for further discussion.

The paper suggests that one of the more important developments is the widespread adoption of *national qualifications frameworks* which can encourage skills portability at all levels. However, there is limited evidence as yet of their wider benefits for the labour market and whether they improve

---

[35] Mahbub ul Haq, *Reflections on Human Development* Oxford University Press, 1995)
[36] McLoughlin S and Rainer M, with Burne R, Hultin G, Muller W and Skeldon R *Temporary and Circular Migration: opportunities and challenges* Working paper No. 35, European Policy Centre (2009).
[37] See Philip L. Martin, 'Migrant workers' vs. 'international service providers': Labour markets and the liberalization of trade in services. In: The Internationalization of Labour Markets", especially sections 6 and 7. http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/inst/download/interlabour.pdf

employability and create greater social dialogue.[38] Where they are based on bilateral or multi-lateral agreements, NQFs can provide a reference mechanism especially when linked to *mutual recognition schemes*, which are now being developed at a global level[39][xxvi] For example, the South African and the Tanzanian systems could be used to enable mobility of labour across southern and eastern Africa, as developed through the small states of the Commonwealth Framework. The Indian Vocational Qualifications and Credit system could be developed and used more widely to relate to systems in destination nations, such as the UAE[40][xxvii]; and the emerging Pakistan NQF[41] could be of value for migrant workers to have their skills assessed before migrating, and on their return.

Information on skills portability could be linked to social as well as economic development in such a way as to encourage women as well as men to be recognized for their skills and qualifications, and enable them to enter occupations that avoid underemployment or de-skilling.[42][xxviii]

National qualifications frameworks can also support the recognition of 'incidental' skills, acquired during a period of migration, which may be of value when a migrant returns home. Examples include language proficiency or business skills.[xxix]

Where national qualifications frameworks do not exist, *"certificates" of work experience* may be used to recognize skills acquired and to support job-matching. For example, Mexico's agreement with educational institutions in the USA for "accreditation" of experience in low skilled jobs is recognized by certain employers in the US. In Sri Lanka and the Philippines, returning migrant workers can have their skills assessed by recognition of prior learning through systems of nationwide skills assessment.[43]

Whether using national qualifications frameworks, mutual recognition schemes or other forms of certification, bilateral and multinational agreements might be based on standardised descriptions such as the International Labour Organization's (ILO) International Standard Classification of Occupations (ISCO),[xxx] allowing portability of skills across countries.

The paper also suggests that specific *schemes encouraging investment by both the supply and destination country and incentivising the migrant to return* can have positive impacts. Migrants may be more inclined to welcome mutual recognition and/or invest in skills acquisition and other human development capability (e.g. remittances) if there are reasonable prospects of return on that investment in their home country or in another destination country.[44] Examples include the provision of scholarships, apprenticeships or paid internships for young people with something to offer the destination country, who are then guaranteed employment in their country of origin.[xxxi]

Bilateral labour schemes have also been used to enable employees to be sent to a company abroad for a defined period of time to complete a work project, thus developing new knowledge and skills.[45] Many of these schemes focus on higher level skills[xxxii]; however they have a dual benefit by developing the skills of the migrant and filling a skills gap in the destination country.[xxxiii] The model appears to be effective where migrants have specific skills to offer the destination country and at the

---

[38] http://www.ilo.org/skills/projects/WCMS_126588/lang--en/index.htm
[39] Personal discussions and involvement by Sue Parker
[40] See also http://www.highereducationinindia.com/vocational-education.htmlh
[41] See http://www.tvetreform.org.pk/PH_NQF_NAVTTC.php
[42] Evidence from IOM in preparation for the Roundtable
[43] *Skills recognition for returning migrant workers*: report of ILO/Skills-AP/Korea Regional Training Workshop on Skills Assessment of Returning Migrant Workers, Bangkok, September 2010
[44] Collyer M, *The Development Impact of Temporary International Migration on Southern Mediterranean Sending Countries; Contrasting Examples of Morocco and Egypt,* Sussex Centre for Migration Research, University of Sussex, UK 2004
[45] Germany cooperates with third party countries to enable employees to be sent to a German company for a defined period of time to complete a work project.

same time can have their proven new skills measured against internationally recognized standards upon return to the home countries.[46][xxxiv]

The paper also suggests that bilateral and multilateral models may benefit from the support of *web-based facilities and investment information centres or 'one-stop-***shops'** for diaspora investors.[47] These may be needed to ensure that people working abroad, or planning to work abroad, have access to information and other schemes to that can optimize job matching[xxxv] and which might, at the same time, encourage skills acquisition and enable the migrant to build on those skills in the destination country[48]. Germany, through its GIZ, has developed ways to support diaspora and migrants in entrepreneurial programs.[xxxvi]

Governments and employers play a vital role in the development of mutual skills recognition schemes and providing information and advice.[49][xxxvii] Investment by social partners in skills recognition schemes may require facilitation or incentivisation by governments to ensure that employer-led assessment procedures are tailored to real labour market needs. For example, advice provided to senior professionals (immigrants and returning expatriates) in Korea[50] focuses on corporate culture, current law and how to develop effective interpersonal relationships to prepare them for work. In the Netherlands, Training and Development Funds set up by social partners facilitate employer participation in the design of assessment methods, in recognition of the need for employers to be aware of the functioning and outcomes of skills recognition procedures.[51]

However, unless assessment is timely, and awareness-raising about the benefits of skills recognition is available, few mobile workers may benefit from recognition of skills gained abroad.[52] Systems which invest in human capital by allowing foreign workers to develop long term employment relationships with employers (egg Canada's Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program, UAE's enhanced policy on mobility, Swedish work permits[53]) seem to foster circular migration patterns, enable workers to accumulate wealth and encourage employers to invest in the skills in their workforce.

2.7   Conclusion

There can be three clear beneficiaries of temporary and circular migration. The migrant benefits by improving his/her living conditions and broadening his/her experience and/or competency.

The destination country benefits by acquiring additional expertise, competence or capacity or a combinations thereof, and the migrant fills a gap in the labour market that would otherwise be difficult to fill. The origin country benefits from money (remittances) that the worker sends back to his/her family, and from the competence and experience that the migrant acquires and uses upon return. There is also evidence, for example from Sweden,[54][xxxviii] or Germany, that the diaspora transfer knowledge, experience and ideas back home even when they do not return ('virtual circulation').

---

[46] Sims, C. (2009). Skills, Migration and Development, City & Guilds Centre for Skills Development. City & Guilds Centre for Skills Development, CSD Working Paper Series.

[47] Such as extensions to the 'Migration Resource Centre' concept.

[48] Portals/databases can improve recognition procedures by storing information on foreign Diplomas. The Diploma supplement, part of Europass, is an example of this. The question is whether such portals can then be shared among countries of origin and destination, (essentially a question of trust), to achieve more efficiency, coherence and transparency.

[49] See also Qualifications For A World Class, Progressive, Education And Skills System Paper presented by Sue Parker to ANQAHE conference, Abu Dhabi, December 2011.
http://www.nqa.gov.ae/pdf/Sue%20Parker%20ANQAHE%20Conference%20paper.pdf

[50] *Ibid* Bangkok, September 2010.

[51] www.labourmigration.eu/events/document/118?format=raw

[52] *Ibid* ILO/Skills-AP/Korea Regional Training Workshop, Bangkok, September 2010.

[53] The Swedish system for labour migration is a good example of how long term relationships with employers can be fostered.

[54] SOU 2010:40 and SOU 2011:28, Reports from the Swedish Parliamentary Committee on Circular Migration and Development.

This paper concludes that coherent policy frameworks, which integrate the whole migration cycle from pre-departure information and skills development to reintegration support in home countries, within the context of a secure legal basis for migrants, enable migrants to be more economically included and improve their human and social development through migration. It points to the use of bilateral and multilateral agreements for providing skills recognition frameworks, the importance of relating skills recognition to job-matching, the role of capacity building for skills development for jobs, the significance of employer involvement in successful schemes, and how de-skilling may be supplemented by re-skilling to support migrant reintegration. However, it also points to the lack of evidence on impacts over the short, medium or long term for origin and destination countries.

Finally, there is scope to use both formal and informal skills recognition and certification systems, based on enabling legal frameworks and internationally recognized occupational standards, as a 'common currency' to support labour mobility and enhance its development outcomes.

3. Questions and outcomes

3.1 Possible Guiding Questions for the RT session debate:

1. What policies and practices have worked to train workers, certify and recognize their skills and match the skills to available jobs, both in countries of origin and destination?

2. How can legal frameworks and programs for labour migration, specifically circular labour mobility, make provision for the development, certification and recognition of persons working abroad?

3. What specific models could Roundtable 1.1 members promote or develop to support bilateral or multilateral future skills recognition and job matching schemes

3.2. Possible outcomes of the Roundtable 1.1 session

1. Model skills upgrading and recognition mechanisms in countries of destination and origin that support effective matching of migrant skills with available jobs abroad and at home after return.

2. Model legal and policy frameworks for temporary and circular labour mobility that enable labour mobility, acquisition or enhancement of skills abroad, and productive use of skills upon return.

3. Compendium of multilateral, regional and bilateral instruments and agreements that use international standards for skills recognition and occupational competency.

1. A survey of the situation of migrant workers, especially women, in RT1.1 member countries to evaluate the extent of labour protection and empowerment through skills development and recognition available in practice.

Annex 1   Terms used in the paper

Migration is the movement of any length of time, composition and causes of a person or a group of persons, either across an international border, or within a state. More specifically, labour *migration* involves the movement of persons from one state to another, or within their own country of residence, for the purpose of employment and is addressed by most states in their migration laws.

Labour mobility is the geographical and occupational movement by workers.

Circular migration is the fluid movement of people between countries, including *temporary* or more permanent movement which, when it occurs voluntarily and is linked to the labor needs of countries of origin and destination, can be beneficial to all involved.

The term *international migrant* may refer to nationals born abroad but returning to their country of origin. Individuals originating from one country but contributing to the development of their destination country, irrespective of their citizenship or nationality, are known as *diaspora.*

Migration is a critical component of *human development*[55]. The UNDP *v*ision of human development is promoting people's freedom to lead the lives they choose. This recognizes mobility as an essential component of that freedom. However, movement involves trade-offs for both movers and stayers, and the understanding and analysis of those trade-offs is key to formulating appropriate policies, including access to health, education, and decent living and working conditions. Vast inequalities characterize not only the freedom to move but also the distribution of gains from movement. When the poorest migrate, *they often do so under conditions of vulnerability that reflect their limited resources and choices*[56].

Skills refer to proficiency, dexterity or competency acquired or developed through training and/or experience. Many migrants have high skills levels and are attracted to destinations for purposes of human development or economic/social reform and/or for quality of life; this may include achieving better pay ('brain-drain'). Others may have low or no skills and are motivated to move to find employment and to send remittances back to their families. Skills acquisition or enhancement may be a motivation incidental for these latter workers.

Training refers to formal, informal and non-formal processes which enable an individual to acquire new skills and knowledge and apply them to improve their performance
_____

---

[55] *Overcoming barriers: Human mobility and development* Human Development Report, UNDP, 2009
[56] *Ibid*, UNDP Report, 2009

Annex 2   End Notes

Section *1.2.   Skilling migrants: the policy context*

[i] **Positive development effect arising from circular migration: the Swedish approach**
A parliamentary committee in Sweden has proposed a number of measures to encourage circular migration and to promote the positive development effects deriving from this kind of mobility. Proposals include that a permanent residence permit should be valid for a longer time after residency in Sweden has ceased, relaxing the rules somewhat for former citizens who wishes to recover citizenship and to extend the possible qualification time for permanent residence permit for persons who has had a temporary working permit for four years. The proposals are currently examined by the governmental offices.[i]

[ii] **As above: the Swedish approach**
This example indicates that a robust regulatory framework can be enabling, under trade or other agreements. However, to maximise developmental benefits, it should work hand in hand with skills development to govern cross border mobility. Note: Sweden also has a program for establishing networks between migrant entrepreneurs from third-countries and Swedish entrepreneurs aimed at enhancing Swedish foreign trade in the countries of origin of migrant entrepreneurs. Reference: OECD(2010),"Open for Business: Migrant Entrepreneurship in OECD Countries, OECD Publishing Paris

[iii] **Enabling legal frameworks**
A robust regulatory framework might include, for example, legal measures to prevent agencies charging exorbitant fees to new migrants in their destination country, validate contracts, facilitate flexible residency rights, guarantee pension rights and extend full rights normally applying to citizens, such as being able to purchase property in the destination country and recognizing dual citizenship to enable regular, circulatory movement back and forth to the home country.

2. The acquisition and development of migrant skills and job matching: good practice

2.1   The role and value of skills development, certification and recognition

[iv] **Policy framework underpinning skills recognition for migrants to Australia**
In Australia there is no single authority which assesses or recognises all overseas qualifications and skill assessments are not an assessment of suitability for employment or the likely success or failure of obtaining an Australian residency status. However, skills recognition and assessment, including through recognition of prior learning and achievement, is an integral part of admission process for migrants to Australia. Many professional, government and other organisations are involved, depending on the type of qualification or occupation and whether the assessment is for the purpose of migration or employment in a particular state or territory of Australia.

[v] **Input of the private sector into skills-job matching – an example from Canada**
The Information and Communications Technology Council (ITCT) in Canada estimates that by 2016 about 106,000 ICT jobs will need to be filled in both traditional and emerging ICT industries — an annual hiring rate of nearly 17,000. The Canadian school system is failing to meet the demands and although many newcomers have the right skills for the jobs, they lack the Canadian experience and networks to help them land those jobs. ICTC's has instigated a pilot bridging program, '*Coaching to Career'*, which launched in May 2012 in Toronto. Aimed at internationally educated professionals (IEPs) in the IT sector, it provides three weeks of employment training, including workplace culture, competencies and communications. The IEPs are then matched with a senior industry executive who provides personalized coaching for six months to help them find a job that is commensurate with their skills and experiences. Once employed, the IEPs receive extended training and support from ICTC for the first three months in their new job.

vi **Regional Model Competency Standards (RMCS) for the Asia-Pacific region**
There are as yet no commonly agreed frameworks or standards for recognizing skill acquisition across countries. The major challenge in qualifications reform thus is to develop a system that is more inclusive, flexible, accessible and transparent yet does not undermine emphasis on quality and credibility. With this challenge in mind, the ILO's SKILLS-AP programme and the Department for Human Resource Development Services of Korea (HRD Korea), as a part of a long-standing partnership, initiated in 2006 a project on recognizing the newly acquired skills of migrant workers. ILO assistance to member States on skills standards, included national and regional training workshops from 2006 to 2008 which resulted in the development and endorsement of the Regional Model Competency Standards (RMCS) for different sectors as a guide for skills assessment and recognition at the national level and for the Asia–Pacific region.

Future employer involvement in skills development, enhancement and recognition – example of the Philippines
The Employer's Confederation of the Philippines actively supported the development and recognition of skills through partnership with social partners. Employers have suggested that there should be a pre-departure checklist and a basic form to be completed by departing workers. They also recommended that a performance appraisal be completed by departing migrant workers and that the advisors are persons of high credibility and trust. The employers have also asked for mapping process that are country specific and pragmatic and that governments should be encouraged to strive for mutual recognition and comparability of qualifications.

Employers have also recommended that the assessment system be a process through which assessors are identified and trained; that the system be decentralized; and that governments determine for themselves whether or not verifiers are necessary. Filipino employers have also proposed that there is a special role for government in the social marketing of re-integration services provided by employers for returning migrant workers; and that government should always consult fully with the social partners. The Employers has also proposed that the government should assume responsibility for the translation and distribution of the ILO Regional Competency Standards (RCMS) to employers' associations. Finally, the draft document should specifically include provision for the skills assessment of returning domestic helpers

vii **Role of national occupational standards for the development of skills and assessment of competency – strategy of the UAE**
The development of occupational standards, against which development of skills and assessment of competency can be measured, are being driven, for example, in the UAE by employers. Early developments include employers determining the key occupations the nation needs to support infrastructure development, and standards customized, based on the best available from the GCC region and western systems. The intention is two-fold: to develop occupational skills and competency to match the best in the world, encouraging skills acquisition as a migrant while on the job, and enabling the migrants on return to their home country have something to show to for their period abroad, benchmarked to international best practice.

viii **Gulf Cooperation Countries (GCC) and the wider Arab Nations**
The Gulf Cooperation Countries (UAE, Saudi Arabia, Bahrain, Qatar, Oman and Kuwait) are currently exploring a Gulf Qualifications framework and the possibility of adopting common occupational standards to support labor market mobility across the GCC. Although they may differ in stage if growth and economic emphasis, the GCC nations are experiencing common challenges arising from rapid economic growth and in particular in balancing the development of the skills of nationals with those brought in by ex-pats. These discussions are in addition to those around the Arab Qualifications Framework, which extends across the MENA region and was formally adopted in May 2012.

[ix] **The South African National Skills Development Framework**
The South African National Skills Development Framework refers to education, training and development activities to help employees and future employees improve their performance and future career prospects; it is designed to address the problem of a fragmented, uncoordinated and haphazard approach to skill development interventions. Sector Education and Training Authorities (SETAs) are responsible for developing strategic skills plans for their respective sectors focusing on ''PIVOTAL'' programmes. These are those ''Professional, Vocational, Technical and Academic Learning'' programmes that meet the critical needs for economic growth and social development of South Africa. As well as focusing on the addressing the South African skills (and poverty gaps), each sector will need to take into account how South Africa as an importer and exporter of migrant labour can address its own human development needs. The SETA plans will be similar to training plans based on occupational requirements – which in some nations might be defined by occupational standards. See also: http://www.inseta.org.za/downloads/framework_for_NSDS_3.pdf

[x] **Saskatchewan Institute for Applied Science and Technology (SIAST) Skills Passport Scheme**

SIAST Skills Passport will guarantee English language proficiency to designated levels and will guarantee technical skills against SIAST certificate and diploma program standards. The program dovetails with the Saskatchewan government's program to boost immigration and responds to employers' labor market needs. It will enhance the success of employers' international recruitment efforts and will facilitate the integration of immigrants into the local workforce. It assures better skills job matching (with attendant proper salary and social protections) for the contract workers. The program supports the Mauritian-Canadian circular migration program and is offered in Mauritius via a partnership between SIAST and the Mauritian Institute of Technology and Development (MITD) for welders and on language skills of mobile workers.

[xi] **Recognition of the skills of nurses in Germany**
In the context of the recognition process, some German hospitals adapt their training for nurses and carers from Bosnia-Hercegovina to facilitate and accelerate the process of skills acquisition. Most of the participants get their skills recognised as nurses after twelve months working on the job. In future projects, the first stage of the adapted training will be delivered in the country of origin, enabling the building of common standards with local education institutions.

[xii] **Importance of employer recognition of migrant skills in the UK**
A Trades Union Congress Report *Migrant Workers in the Labour Market (2008),* revealed a huge gap between the present contribution migrant workers make to the UK economy, and the contribution they could make if their skills and qualifications were recognised by employers. The study said many migrant workers were trapped in low-skill, low-paid jobs that did not use the skills and experience gained back home. The research highlighted a lack of awareness among employers, and a failure to recruit migrants into jobs that enabled their careers to progress.

[xiii] **Construction Skills (employer-led Sector Skills Council) in the UK**
For example, the Construction Plant Competence Scheme (CPCS) is a card scheme to prove the skills of plant operators. It helps to prove workers' operating skills and health and safety awareness and provides a single skills card for the plant sector of the construction industry.

2.2 Skills development and job-matching

[xiv] **Examples of adjustments to national education and training programs**
India: Manipal Education, one of India's largest education providers, has signed an agreement with City and Guilds to deliver training through IndiaSkills. This joint venture has the objective of producing 500 centres and 1 million learners in 5 years with the aim of redefining the way education and training is delivered in India. It will enable students to obtain internationally-recognized skills-

based qualifications in a wide range of industries, beginning with retail, hospitality, banking and English language training.

Japan-Philippines and Japan-Indonesia: Japan-Philippines and Japan-Indonesia Economic Partnership Agreements have been designed to enable migrants from the origin countries send back remittances and at the same time address skills shortages in Japan, under ''designated activities'' migration status. In the Philippines caregivers can receive training and acquire qualifications that are specific to the needs of Japan. However, since 2010 the number of migrants has declined, partly resulting from inability of the migrants to speak Japanese and the costs to the migrant of the required training if they do it in Japan.

Jamaica-Canada: A scheme training nurses in Jamaica for the Canadian market was halted in 2011, as three years after the scheme launched, the vast majority of those trained were still in Jamaica, having paid large financial costs to be trained. Of the 156 completing the programme, only 30 proceeded to Canada. Evaluation of the programme suggests that schools accepted persons into the programme who did not meet the matriculation requirement and after sitting their exams, were barred from entering the public-hospital system to do their practical sessions, which are needed for them to be certified as licensed practical nurses in Canada. Others did not meet the qualification criteria of an enrolled assistant nurse, which is being used as the measuring rod for the licensed practical nurse programme. This emphasises the need for there to be very clear expectations and parameters before prospective migrants commence long programmes, even though programmes of this nature improve human capital, if jobs are available, the migrants do not then leave.

South Africa: This shows the complexity of movement: South Africa is a net supplier of teachers to other countries, in part because of a perceived surplus of trained teachers. Botswana has used expatriate teachers because of insufficient supply of local teachers. In both cases, there are signs that the international teacher mobility may have been temporary, something of a transitory movement as the local market for teachers adjusts. In South Africa, the idea that there is a surplus of local teachers is being officially questioned, while in Botswana, the government has actively developed its teacher training institutions so that it need no longer depend on expatriate teachers. Nonetheless, broad economic considerations might warrant the continuation of such flows. South Africa's mass unemployment suggests a surplus of labour; while conversely Botswana's economic growth 'miracle' fuels the demand for labour.

[xv] **Movement of engineers across Europe**
The European Federation of National Engineering Associations (FEANI) is facilitating the movement of practicing engineers within and outside the geographical area represented by FEANI's member countries and to establish a framework of mutual recognition of qualifications in order to enable engineers who wish to practice outside their own country to carry with them a guarantee of competence. FEANI is promoting EUR-ING – a title based on those graduating from an INDEX listing the institutions of engineering higher education in European countries represented within FEANI, and their engineering programmes, which are all recognized by FEANI as fulfilling the mandatory education requirements for the EUR ING - which encourages trans-European mobility – a form of skills passport. Mobility is important for engineers, because of the: demand for flexible deployment on an international basis different availability of engineers across national borders. Engineers and Employers require a tool: that shows a comparable educational profile whose recognition is based on international standards is easy to use for professionals and employers

[xvi] **The Ontario Skills Passport** provides clear descriptions of the Essential Skills and work habits important for work, learning and life. The Essential Skills are used in virtually all occupations and are transferable from school to work, job to job and sector to sector. It is not used at present to support job matching, but with its focus on generic skills could support labour mobility.

2.3   *Capacity building to enable job-matching*

xviii **Norwegian Training Center - Manila (NTC-M)**
NTC-M came into operation in February 1990 and was shortly after made part of Norwegian Maritime Foundation of the Philippines, Inc. (NMFPI), chartered in May 1990. At the time around 25,000 Filipino seafarers were serving on Norwegian - owned or controlled ships. NSA and its members launched a safety and quality initiative in order to restore the quality and reputation of Norwegian shipping in general and in particular to improve the human factor in ship operation. Seafarers of all nationalities and from non-Norwegian shipping organisations are also welcome to attend any of the courses provided the space is available and their course fees are paid for by their local agents or their sponsoring companies.

xix **Education and Training for Egyptian Youth in Fayoum Governorate**
Through this project, IOM worked with Italian training authorities, the Egyptian Ministry of Education, as well as Italian and Egyptian employers in order to improve the quality of training at a tourism school in Fayoum to meet the needs of major hospitality employers in Italy and Egypt and to harmonize with EQF qualifications levels. This included developing a new curriculum, improving the physical training facilities, re-training teachers, and establishing communication networks between the tourism school and industry employers.

The project has also established a database for international job matching which includes use of international occupation standard classifications (ISCO) to enhance employer understanding of candidate skills. The database is currently integrating an evaluation component based on European Training Foundation (ETF) methodology thereby further enhancing European employers' ability to understand and assess the skills of Egyptian candidates in the database. It forms part of a wider ETF program in Europe's 'neighbouring' nations.
Overall, the project aims to match qualified Egyptian workers better with the labor needs of foreign employers by enhancing training to meet labor market needs and improving the transparency of information systems.

xx **Swedish migration policy as an enabler to fill gaps in employer skills needs**
Swedish policy allows migrants of all skill levels and merits to apply for a vacant position. By adopting a demand-driven approach, the system is designed to be responsive to the skills-needs of the employer. There is an in-built assumption that this will minimize de-skilling that could otherwise occur in skilled programs based on points-systems. In 2009, the Swedish Government commissioned the OECD to conduct a study of the Swedish labour immigration system. The review was published in December last year, the first in a series of similar studies, and the OECD concluded that Sweden's labour migration policy is one of the most open in the OECD, and has helped businesses hire foreign workers quickly and cheaply, without hurting conditions for local workers.

xxi **Netherlands: 'Blue Birds' programme**
Lessons from the Netherlands Pilot Circular Migration Programme - the 'Blue Birds' programme were:
- Labour migration is supply & demand driven, and facilitating the needs of employers and employees via existing structures should be at the heart of migration innovation.
- The balance may need to be switched from creating development policies that have the potential to lead to labour migration to labour migration policies that have the potential to lead to development.

- Recruitment of international staff is not the core business of companies: they lack expertise and time for matchmaking within a complex international environment
- Business expects government to create a framework that enables recruitment agencies and recruitment intermediaries to actively initiate and execute innovative pilots on labour migration.
- Government, organizations and individuals must be equal partners to secure success, understand the goals of each partner and be willing to support and respect these as the basis for shared innovation and shared benefits.

2.5 Elements of a coherent policy framework

[xxii] **MIDA Ghana Health III**
This program engages Ghanaian health professionals from mainly the Netherlands, Germany and the United Kingdom in the development of human resources capacity in the health sector of Ghana. It facilitates a limited number of overseas training options for health workers from Ghana. The program also assesses the option for long term return by these professionals to Ghana.

[xxiii] **Collaboration within a south-south scheme - Costa Rica and Nicaragua; good practice in Latin America**
The program is designed to promote sensitive labour market practices for national, migrant and refugee populations at local through level joint actions. Employers are involved in the program through guaranteeing round trip transportation and hygienic lodgings. In this example, skills acquisition is secondary to the creation of a social framework within which migrants can operate securely, and are supported, including when they return home. Social responsibility can be interpreted as supporting skills development for the individual in order to build human capital.

[xxiv] **The Abu Dhabi dialogue**
The Abu Dhabi Dialogue priorities are to:
- Identify the roles and responsibilities of all actors (governmental and private) at each stage of the contractual work cycle (from recruitment to preparation to movement to work in a host country to return and reintegration) to ensure safe, protected and beneficial labour mobility. This has far-reaching impact at every stage of the migration cycle.
- Elaborate concrete projects activities ("practical outcomes" and related plan of action) to give effect to the partnerships.
- Elaborate a regional multilateral framework on temporary contractual labour mobility; in other words encouraging movement of workers to where they can most effectively job match in a similar context or environment to their point of entry.
- Support knowledge transfer alongside vocational or language training.

2.6   Skills development and recognition solutions for further discussion

The program is designed to promote sensitive labour market practices for national, migrant and refugee populations at local through level joint actions. Employers are involved in the program through guaranteeing round trip transportation and hygienic lodgings. In this example, skills acquisition is secondary to the creation of a social framework within which migrants can operate securely, and are supported, including when they return home. Social responsibility can be interpreted as including skills development for the individual in order to build human capital.

[xxv] **Examples of initiatives under the Africa–EU Migration, Mobility and Employment (MME) partnership** (launched in 2007) include developing the African Remittances Institute, which aims to facilitate cheaper, faster, and more secure remittance flows from Europe to Africa, Diaspora Outreach Initiative, which builds on existing work to transfer skills, capacity, and knowledge to Africa, the Pan-African University's Nyerere Program, which aims to contribute to high-level African human resource development and retention and supporting intra-African academic mobility the Centre for

Migration Management and Information in Mali (with support from the Economic Community of West African States [ECOWAS], France, Spain, and the European Commission) and work on an African Guarantee Fund (by the African Development Bank and Spain) to increase access to finance for small and medium enterprises – especially relevant for returning migrants.

[xxvi] **Global mutual recognition schemes: UNESCO's 6 regional Conventions on the Recognition of Qualifications** (Africa, Arab States, Asia and Pacific, Latin America and the Caribbean, and 2 European conventions) and 1 interregional convention (Mediterranean Convention), are aimed at promoting mutual recognition of academic qualifications for academic purposes and diplomas for professional purposes. They are at different stages of development and implementation; and do not seem to adequately cover lower level skills; indeed may not even be keeping pace with new qualifications, new providers and the latest forms of education delivery. It is also not clear how they are keeping up with facilitating cross-border skilled mobility.

[xxvii] **Indian vocational education**
One of the weaknesses of Indian education system is that it does not gives due importance to vocational education. As a result there is a mismatch between the skilled manpower required and skilled manpower available. Every year India turns out millions of graduates who do not have the specific skill sets required by the market. Recent press reports suggest that this may already be beginning to hurt Indian's economic growth.

[xxviii] **Evidence of importance of skill recognition schemes**
The IOM points to the importance of having skills recognised through several studies in the European Union which compared the labour market outcomes of migrants holding similar skills and competences who have achieved recognition against those who did not. Further data collection and analysis of the effects for migrants in terms of labour market insertion in having their qualifications and competences earned in countries of origin are required to better understand the significance of the recognition factor.

[xxix]**Specific investment by the supply and destination country – the example of France/Mauritius**
In Mauritius, returning migrants after a period of temporary migration in France are helped to find employment in new economic sectors or to set up SMEs by the authorities through training (including a dedicated training centre), equipment and financial assistance for the start-up.

[xxx] **ILO and ISCO**
ILO is the international organization responsible for drawing up and overseeing international labour standards. It is the only 'tripartite' United Nations agency that brings together representatives of governments, employers and workers to jointly shape policies and programs promoting Decent Work for all

ISCO is one of the main international classifications for which ILO is responsible and is a tool for organizing jobs into a clearly defined set of groups according to the tasks and duties undertaken in the job. Its main aims are to provide:
- a basis for the international reporting, comparison and exchange of statistical and administrative data about occupations;
- a model for the development of national and regional classifications of occupations; and
- a system that can be used directly in countries that have not developed their own national classifications

[xxxi] **Models of skills development – apprenticeships in Italy**
Italy's Aeneas Community Action Programme (2007-10) demonstrates a positive approach to skills development and reintegration. Italy has provided apprenticeships to young Moldovans, Russians and Ukrainians who could then be guaranteed employment in their country of origin. Although this

formed part of a temporary migration scheme, it focused on developing the skills of the migrant as well as on filling a skills gap in Italy.

xxxii **Examples of schemes designed to develop higher level skills in migrants**
The private sector launched an initiative in 2010 in Belgium to facilitate one year paid internships for Senegalese university graduates in Belgian companies. The Czech Republic offered scholarships in 2006-10 to nationals from developing countries – with eight priority countries targeted: Angola, Bosnia, Moldova, Mongolia, Serbia, Yemen, Vietnam and Zambia.

xxxiii **Specific investment by the supply and destination country – the example of France/Mauritius**
In Mauritius, returning migrants after a period of temporary migration in France are helped to find employment in new economic sectors or to set up SMEs by the authorities through training (including a dedicated training centre), equipment and financial assistance for the start-up.

xxxiv **Models and curricula for training professionals**
Models and curricula for training professionals in developing countries and regions to international standards can be provided by governments, private sector, educational/training institutes, or professional associations. Although not wholly a success, in the Caribbean, the University of West Indies uses a curriculum for training nurses to Canadian standards, that has been furnished by the Canadian Nurses Association but also caters to the needs of aspiring (mobile) nurses from the whole Caribbean region.

xxxv **Examples of provision of information to migrants**
A few African governments have assisted potential migrants by providing information on migration opportunities, and counselling them about the risks involved in migration, but offer little advice on skills development. Ethiopia, Kenya, and Senegal provide pre- departure orientation seminars to inform migrants about potential abuses. The Ethiopian government has also established an office to regulate private recruitment agencies, which are required to obtain a one year, renewable license, to report on their work, and to submit to audits to ensure that workers are not being cheated. Migration Resource Centres have been established in Sarande, Albania, Australia, Colombia, Croatia, Republic of the Congo, Lebanon, Mali, and Filipino Workers Resource Centres in various countries, Portugal, Slovakia, Sri Lanka and Tajikistan.

xxxvi **German programs to develop skills**
Germany, through GIZ, has developed ways to support diaspora and migrants in entrepreneurial programs through the development of a "tool box" called ''MITOS'' to support members of the diaspora who want to engage economically and become entrepreneurs, Germany has also established a pilot training program for Moroccans in Germany who want to return and invest in their home country ("business Ideas for Morocco").

xxxvii **Schemes led by the private sector rather than government**
Where driven by employers in a sector such as science and technology in Egypt, NQFs may have greater credibility but can be narrow in scope.

xxxviii **Building long term relationships with employers – the example of Sweden**
The Swedish system for labour migration is a good example of how long term relationships with employers can be fostered. The Swedish legislation for labour migration is demand driven and open to migrants of all skill levels, i.e. the employer decides who they want to hire, regardless of skill levels or formal merits. The legislation allows migrants who are employed to stay in Sweden with a work permit for four years. If they are still employed after that they qualify for a permanent residence permit.